

Presentation at the Congress of Humanities and Social Sciences

June 5, 2015, University of Ottawa

Maria Cheung, PhD, Associate Professor, Faculty of Social Work, University of
Manitoba

Evidence on FOH from the global investigations

As you've heard the evidence provided by Hon. David Kilgour, I will now highlight just the major findings from various investigations on this issue. **What do we know as of today?**

Since 1999, China has performed over 150,000 transplants. This constitutes the second largest national transplant volume in the world, yet voluntary donation at home is nearly non-existent. China did not have any organ donations until 2003. Out of the 120,000 transplants performed between 1999 and 2010, a mere 130 official donations were registered. David Kilgour and David Matas' report is not the only investigation that found Falun Gong practitioners as the major target of forced organ harvesting in China. Investigations from Israel and the United States have come to the same conclusions.

China's large volume of annual transplants made it the only place in the world that can offer organs within weeks of a request, instead of years. Chinese hospitals advertised on their websites that transplantations could be scheduled in advance and performed within 1-4 weeks. Organ transplant rates in China climaxed in 2005-2006. From 1999-2006, the number of transplant centers in China surged from 150 to 600 (an increase of 400%). During that period, surgeons in many countries sent patients directly to China for quick transplant wait times. When Matas and Kilgour released their first report that revealed the involuntary sources of organs from China and raised awareness of forced organ harvesting, the international demand for China's organs retracted. China's organ transplants now predominantly serve an internal market.

Years of investigation has identified the chain of operation in this organ harvesting business, led by the Chinese Communist Party (CCP). Largely employing military

hospitals as the operational arm, the CCP orchestrated the court and prison system (including forced labour camps and black jails) to systematically subject Falun Gong practitioners to selective medical tests for tissue matching. Test results are stored in a large data bank. Middle persons access organ transplant patients from external and internal markets and refer these clients for organ transplant. With the second largest national organ transplant volume in the world, extremely low donation rates and exceptionally short wait periods, detained Falun Gong practitioners became a major source of forced organ harvesting. There exists a large living organ donor pool, in particular the Falun Gong, available on demand. The forced organ transplant establishment is a source of huge financial gain for the Chinese state. A cornea is sold to transplant tourists for US\$30,000. Vital organs such as the heart, liver, lung and kidney are typically sold over US\$100,000 each. Several military hospital websites boasted that organ transplantation was their number one source of revenue.

What is Falun Gong and why the persecution?

Falun Gong, also known as Falun Dafa, is an ancient spiritual cultivation practice for mind, body and spirit guided by the universal principles of truthfulness, compassion and tolerance. Falun Gong was introduced to China in 1992. By word of mouth, many people practised. In mid-1990s China, the practice was very visible in local communities. In fact, the practice won many awards in China during that time.

Lowe (2003) surveyed 85 Falun Gong practitioners and found the following popular reasons for the exponential growth of Falun Gong in China:

- Emphasis on being true (authentic);
- Creates a high moral standard;
- Promotes health – numerous surveys find that over 95% of people who practice the Falun Gong meditation were healed from their illnesses;
- Promotes spiritual growth.

Although the Falun Gong only brought benefits and caused no harm to others, harassment and public attacks on practitioners intensified and escalated in the mid-1990s. After a peaceful protest had been organized by Falun Gong practitioners in Beijing on April 25, 1999 to appeal for the release of forty-five practitioners after they were unreasonably detained, the former leader of the Chinese Communist Party, Jiang Zemin, ordered that the group be destroyed in three months. The appeal was legitimate according to the Chinese constitution, yet Jiang maintained the launched of a systematic persecution campaign aimed at eradicating this peaceful meditative group.

As forced organ harvesting in China has been occurring since the persecution began in 1999, many have asked: *Why the persecution?*

I have summarized the major reasons discovered by scholars on the causes of persecution of this group:

- In the mid to late 1990s, Chinese state official statistics indicated around 70-100 million people practised Falun Gong in China. Among them were 700,000 CCP members.
- The rapid expansion of Falun Gong meant that practitioners outnumbered the Chinese Communist Party membership, which triggered Jiang Zemin's jealousy and insecurity over the practice.
- Falun Gong offers a set of spiritual principles independent of the state, while the Communist ideology is losing ground in China.
- The CCP felt especially threatened by the moral standard set by Falun Gong practitioners – corruption was already ingrained in every system while the practice of truthfulness, compassion and tolerance of Falun Gong is contrary to the conflict ideology, self-interest and deceitful culture of the CCP.

The following figures denote persecution facts besides the large-scale organ seizures from unwilling Falun Gong practitioners:

- 3800+ confirmed deaths through police abuse and torture during custody. Due to the information blockage from China, this number only represents those that

contain very detailed evidence. So it is only the tip of the iceberg; the real figure would be much higher. This number also does not include those who have died in the process of live organ harvesting of Falun Gong practitioners in China.

- 450,000-1 million – estimated number of Falun Gong practitioners held in labour camps, prisons and other long-term detention facilities at *any given time* (Ethan Gutmann, 2014). The longest prison terms are up to 20 years.
- Tens of thousands of documented cases of beatings, torture, rape and other severe abuses.
- Thousands of healthy individuals incarcerated and tortured in psychiatric institutions, similar to the political abuse of psychiatry in Soviet Union, which is condemned by the World Psychiatric Association.
- Many displaced in order to avoid arrest and adversely affecting their families and relatives. Millions of families have been torn apart.

Beatings, detention in forced labour camps, brainwashing and torture have become the daily reality of many practitioners. Methods include hanging victims from ceilings, shocking with high-voltage electric batons, sleep deprivation, starvation, sexual assault, forced abortions, drug injections and forced-feeding. Most of the abuse takes place in secret behind closed doors, detention centers, labour camps and mountainside torture chambers. The purpose is to force them to recant their belief. The U.N. former Special Rapporteur on torture reported in 2006 that Falun Gong practitioners account for 66% of torture cases in China. He states: “the cruelty and brutality of these alleged acts of torture defy description.” Despite the systematic and large-scale nature of the persecution, we need to know that the persecution of Falun Gong actually has no constitutional and legal basis in China. It is a command from the CCP, under the leadership of Jiang Zemin.

The persecution of Falun Gong under the Chinese Communist regime has violated many articles not only in the provisions of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR) to which China is a signatory, but also in China’s own constitution’s article 35 and 36 on freedom of speech and freedom of religious belief respectively. Under the UDHR, the

Chinese regime violates article 18 on freedom of religion and belief; articles 4 and 5 on protection from torture, cruel punishment and any form of slave labour; articles 9, 10, 11 on due process of law; and article 19 on freedom of assembly and association (Casil, 2004).

I draw upon a Foucauldian discourse analysis (Foucault, 1972) to analyze the persecution of Falun Gong by the Chinese communist regime:

- Power and knowledge – how the dominant power controls knowledge. The CCP monopolizes communication resources to control what the Chinese people know. In the first 30 days of the crackdown, over 300 slanderous articles appeared in the People’s Daily, China’s state-run national paper and the main mouthpiece of the Communist Party. Television and radio programs continue to demonize Falun Gong. This propaganda has long-term effects on the Chinese population who have no other legal sources of information.
- The persecution of Falun Gong illustrates how a group of people is subjugated by the dominant power to become an “object” and disciplined when they are defined as the “enemy” by the Chinese Communist regime.
- Language and meaning played an important role in this domination of power relations.

The CCP-led regime socially constructs the Falun Gong as a devalued group through defamation, mass surveillance and mobilization of the public against them. In order to justify the persecution, the regime launched an intensive nationwide media denunciation campaign to incite hatred against the Falun Gong, which is a common strategy inherited from past political practices of the CCP (Chu, 1997).

The climax of hate propaganda targeted against the Falun Gong was reached with the self-immolation of five people in Tiananmen Square, staged by the CCP and aired by its media arm, China Central Television (CCTV) in 2001; it was charged that these individuals practiced Falun Gong. Even though Western media and analysis outside of China has found that these self-immolated individuals were not Falun Gong practitioners,

the general public was swayed into either believing the government propaganda, or being too afraid to speak about the subject matter.

Without public support, Falun Gong practitioners were sent to forced labour camps and brainwashing centres, mostly without trial. The CCP set up a gestapo-like “610 office”, a security agency that can bypass the legal system and send practitioners directly to detention. Despite an official abolition of forced labour camps in 2014 under international pressure, practitioners are still being sent to extra-judicial confinement in brainwashing centres, which adopts mind control and violence to force practitioners to renounce their belief. Detained practitioners are subjected to forced labour, physical, psychological and sexual abuses, and severe torture.

In the last 60 plus years, the CCP has ruled China by forming a culture of violence. As Chu Yuan-Hong (1997) wrote, “[the Chinese regime] uses rituals of violence and the rhetoric of denunciation and popular mobilization not merely to eliminate ‘enemies’ but also to create a political culture in which violence is taken for granted.” (p.69). Different groups have been targeted systematically over various periods: the Three-Anti and Five-Anti campaigns in 1952, the anti-right movement in the late 1950s, the Cultural Revolution in the 1960s, the suppression of Tiananmen Square student movement in the 1980s, and the Falun Gong in the 1990s. The false charges, frame-ups, home ransacking, and use of torturous means to force Falun Gong practitioners to renounce their beliefs are simply inherited from the Cultural Revolution.

Is the systematic persecution and organ pillaging of Falun Gong practitioners in China genocide?

According to the definition given by the United Nations Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide (1948), it is. The convention provides that genocide can be committed both in war and in peace times. We have been shown a clear intention and act committed by the CCP. In 1999, the former chairman of the CCP, Jiang Zemin, personally launched this systematic genocide campaign and planned to eradicate Falun Gong practitioners physically, mentally and financially. The CCP has targeted Falun Dafa practitioners for 15 years in many ways that parallel genocide. Tens of millions of Falun Gong practitioners have been and continues to be abducted, imprisoned

with long sentences, sent to forced labour, tortured, fired from jobs, expelled from school or forced into homelessness. At least 65,000 practitioners have been harvested of their organs. The NGO World Organization Investigating the Persecution of Falun Gong (WOIPFG) has found clear evidence revealing that the top leaders of the Chinese Communist Party are orchestrating the organ pillaging of Falun Gong practitioners. As David Matas has pointed out, “the organ sourcing is the means while the physical destruction is the intent.” Fifteen years of the "eradication" campaign against Falun Gong practitioners by the Chinese communist regime remains the most systematic and widespread, largest-scale modern-day atrocity against a group of innocent people happening across China today.

As responsible members of the global community, we have an obligation to help China abide by basic human rights and ethical principles—values that are already enshrined in their national constitution and international treaties they have signed. Being social scientists, we know that neutrality only means taking side with the dominant power. In the Falun Gong case, the dominant power CCP has deployed considerable resources to defame and fabricate disinformation about the Falun Gong. Being neutral will only lead to indifference and perpetuate the genocide.

Policies, actions and public opinion in the West do have an impact on China. There have been many efforts around the world condemning China for organ pillaging. Significantly, the European Parliament passed a unanimous resolution condemning this inhumane practice in China:

<http://www.europarl.europa.eu/sides/getDoc.do?type=TA&reference=P7-TA-2013-0603&language=EN&ring=P7-RC-2013-0562>

Canada raised both issues of the persecution of Falun Gong and forced organ harvesting at the UN Human Rights Council on March 12, 2014:

"We remain concerned that Falun Gong practitioners and other religious worshippers in China face persecution, and reports that organ transplants take place without free and informed consent of the donor are troubling."

The House of Commons' all-party subcommittee on International Human Rights released a statement condemning the pillaging of organs from Falun Gong:

<http://www.parl.gc.ca/HousePublications/Publication.aspx?DocId=6769309&Language=E&Mode=1>

Similar statements have been issued in the United States, Israel, Italy etc. Various international medical associations such as the World Medical Association and The Transplantation Society have also issued strong statements against this unethical practice. However in these statements, only executed prisoners were mentioned as being target of forced organ harvesting, while the majority in fact is prisoners of conscience, in particular the Falun Gong. Further, it has been found that a very effective way to address this issue is by grassroots awareness-raising efforts. The *Doctors Against Forced Organ Harvesting* (www.dafoh.org) has collected about two million signatures around the world and presented to the United Nations. Another effective means is scholarly peer review. The *Lancet* has been scrutinizing journal submissions from Chinese transplant surgeons. If the source of organs of their research does not satisfy the ethical standard, their papers are rejected. Similar practice is adopted by international medical conferences.

It is important for us to take a stand and ask China to respect basic global human rights and ethical standards—to stop killing innocent citizens. Crimes against humanity are crimes against all. When crimes against humanity are committed, we are all victims. We must not let a misguided sense of tolerance for different “cultural values” lead us into complicity with practices that are in fact the result of inhumanity and disregard for basic human rights.

Main References:

Cheung, M. (2012). “Invisible minorities” of the Falun Gong community: Challenge to social inclusion and integration in Canada. In M. Baffoe with M. Cheung, L. Asimeng-Boahene, & Ogbuagu, B. (Eds.), *Strangers in New Homelands: The social deconstruction and reconstruction of “home” among immigrants in the diaspora* (pp.200-209). UK: Cambridge Publishing Press.

Chu, Y. H. (1997). The counterrevolution – A family of crimes: Chinese Communist Revolutionary rhetoric, 1929-89. In J. Turpin & L.R. Kurtz (Eds.), *The web of violence: From personal to global* (pp. 69-89). Chicago: University of Illinois.

Doctors Against Forced Organ Harvesting (DAFOH): <http://www.dafoh.org/>

Falun Dafa Clearwisdom (2001). Self-immolation. Retrieved on November, 2014: <http://en.minghui.org/html/cate-213/>

Falun Dafa Info Centre: <http://www.faluninfo.net/>

Foucault, M. (1972). *The archaeology of knowledge and the discourse of language* Vol. 50. New York, NY: Pantheon Books.

Gutmann, E. (2014). *The Slaughter: Mass killings, organ harvesting, and China's secret solution to its dissident problem*. New York, NY: Prometheus Books.

Healy, L. M. (2007). Universalism and cultural relativism in social work ethics. *International Social Work*, 50(1), 11-26.

Lowe, S. (2003). *Chinese and International Contexts for the Rise of Falun Gong*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Matas, D. & Cheung, M. (2012). Retrospects and Prospects: Canadian Tribunals, Human Rights, and Falun Gong. *Canadian Journal of Human Rights*, 1(1), 62-91.

Matas, D. & Trey, T. (2012). *State Organs: Transplant abuse in China*. ON: Seraphim.

Matas, D. & Kilgour, D. (2009). *Bloody Harvest: The killing of Falun Gong for their organs*. ON: Seraphim.

Nowak, M. (2006). Mission to China: United Nation Report of the Special Rapporteur on torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment, (UN Document E/CN.4/2006/6/Add.6 10 March 2006)

Ownby, D. (2008). *Falun gong and the future of China*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Sharif, A., Fiatarone Singh, M., Trey, T., & Lavee, J. (2014). Organ procurement from executed prisoners in China. *American Journal of Transplantation*, XX, 1-7.

World Organization to Investigate the Persecution of Falun Gong:
<http://www.zhuichaguoji.org/en/>